

Chatham County, NC

Meeting Minutes

Board of Commissioners

Monday, May 18, 2015

6:00 PM

Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Work Session - 3:00 PM - Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Present: 5 - Chairman Jim Crawford, Commissioner Mike Cross, Vice Chair Diana Hales, Commissioner Karen Howard and Commissioner Walter Petty

CLOSED SESSION

15-1248

Closed Session to discuss matters within the attorney/client privilege and to approve closed session minutes.

A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Vice Chair Cross, that the Board go out of the Work Session and convene in Closed Session for the purposes of discussing matters within the attorney/client privilege and approving Closed Session minutes. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

PUBLIC INPUT SESSION

Jim Elza, 110 Christow Court, Cary, gave the following comments:

I came to take a minute to applaud you for addressing the Board of Adjustment provisions of the law. The Board of Adjustment is known as a safety valve for development ordinance provisions that don't always fit the circumstance. One size doesn't always fit all. Commissioners Cross and Petty know full well how much effort goes into these decisions. I have seen many such citizen boards in action and I know they will make fair decisions for this county. As the county grows, the Board of Adjustment job will also grow. Thank you for looking forward and modernizing this process.

BOARD PRIORITIES

<u>15-1244</u> Transportation Advisory Committee (TAC) Annual Report 2014-2015

Attachments: TAC Annual Report May 2015

Transportation Advisory Committee Annual Report

Hillary Pace, Planner, introduced the Chair of the Transportation Advisory Committee, Ed Regan. Mr. Reagan gave a PowerPoint Presentation with the Annual Report.

The committee would like to proceed with revisiting and updating the TAC Strategic Plan and continue to form partnerships with existing agencies such as Chatham Transit.

Chairman Crawford stated there has to be an off and on ramp added on Highway 421 near the Siler City Megasite. He asked what things needed to be done to push that forward. Mr. Regan stated they discussed this issue at their April meeting. A gentleman from Siler City who owns a farm adjacent to where the interchange would be built was there asking some questions about his access. He stated there hasn't been a detailed plan of the interchange yet by the NCDOT. Ms. Pace stated the process is in the County's jurisdiction. Planning staff has been looking into a minor or major subdivision process and is working with the real estate consultant.

The County Manager stated Kimley Horne and Associates is also working on that access issue.

Commissioner Hales asked if on occasions where there is a citizen with a complaint, does the TAC tackle that or does it focus more toward the planning. Mr. Regan stated the TAC focuses more toward planning. The committee regularly has DOT people at their meetings and they are usually able to address any complaints or issues brought up by the citizens.

15-1113

Vote on a request to approve a proposed county-initiated text amendment to the Chatham County Zoning Ordinance Section 18, Board of Adjustment, to update the ordinance in response to statutory changes.

<u>Attachments:</u> More Info

Hillary Pace, Planner, reviewed the specifics of the request.

A motion was made by Commissioner Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2015-21 Adopting a Consistency Statement for the Text Amendment to Section 18 of the Zoning Ordinance of Chatham County, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales,
Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

A motion was made by Commissioner Hales, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Ordinance, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales,
Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

15-1252 Vote on Appointments to Board of Adjustment

Commissioner Hales stated it was great to have applications from every district. She is concerned about people serving on more than one committee. She is concerned about absenteeism as well. This group meets as needed, maybe only once or twice a year but there shouldn't be absences.

The Chairman opened the floor for nominations.

Commissioner Petty nominated Pamela Hawe for District 5

Chairman Crawford nominated Phillip Cox for District 4

Commissioner Hales nominated Rebecca Newton for District 3

Commissioner Cross nominated Peyton Hollard for District 2

Commissioner Howard nominated Carol Robbins for District 1

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the slate of appointments for all five districts be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

It was suggested that District 1, 3, and 5 appointments serve three year terms and District 2 and 4 appointments serve two year terms in order to stagger the terms.

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that District 1, 3, and 5 appointments have three year terms and District 2 and 4 appointments have two year terms. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

Commissioner Petty nominated Tom Glendinning for the At Large Alternate appointment.

Commissioner Hales nominated Billy Hinton and Cynthia Herman for the At Large Alternate Appointment.

The Chair stated a decision would need to be made between Tom Glendinning and Cynthia Herman because they were from the same district. The Chair called for a vote. Tom Glendinning received three votes. Cynthia Herman received two votes.

The slate for the At Large Alternate Appointments was Tom Glendinning and Billy Hinton.

A motion was made by Commissioner Petty, seconded by Vice Chair Cross, that the slate of At Large Alternate Appointments be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

It was suggested the at large appointments serve three year terms.

A motion was made by Commissioner Petty, seconded by Vice Chair Cross, that the At Large Alternate Appointments serve three year terms. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Commissioner Petty, that this meeting be adjourned. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

End of Work Session

Regular Session - 6:00 PM - Historic Courthouse Courtroom

Present: 5 - Chairman Jim Crawford, Commissioner Mike Cross, Vice Chair Diana Hales, Commissioner Karen Howard and Commissioner Walter Petty

INVOCATION and PLEDGE OF ALLEGIANCE

Commissioner Cross delivered the invocation after which the Chairman invited everyone present to stand and recite the Pledge of Allegiance.

CALL TO ORDER

Chairman Crawford welcomed those in attendance and called the meeting to order at 6:00 PM.

APPROVAL OF AGENDA and CONSENT AGENDA

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the Agenda and Consent Agenda be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

Vote on a request to approve the April 13, 2015 Special Meeting Minutes and the April 20, 2015 Work and Regular Session Minutes.

Attachments: Draft Minutes 04.13.2015

Draft Minutes 04.20.2015

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Minutes be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

15-1193 Vote on a request to approve \$167.00 Communicable Disease Funds.

<u>Attachments:</u> \$167.00 CD Funds Agreement Addendum.pdf

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1219</u>	Vote on a request to approve \$7,228 Environmental Health State Inspections Funds.
	Attachments: \$7,228 Environmental Health State Funds.pdf
	A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1231</u>	Vote on a request to approve \$866.50 Animal Services Funds.
	<u>Attachments:</u> \$866.50 Animal Services Funds Account Balance Inquiry
	A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1234</u>	Vote on Appointment to the Nursing Home & Adult Home Community Care Committee
	A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Appointment be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1239</u>	Appointment of Physician Seat to the BOH - Tammy Lynn Morris Lloyd, MD
	<u>Attachments:</u> Physician Seat - Tammy Lynn Morris Lloyd
	A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Appointment be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1240</u>	Appointment of Registered Nurse Seat to the BOH
	Attachments: Nurse Seat - Carol Reitz-Barlow
	A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Appointment be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:
	Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty
<u>15-1241</u>	Appointment of Optometrist Seat to the BOH
	<u>Attachments:</u> Optometrist Seat - William Roscoe

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Appointment be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

<u>15-1242</u> Vote on a request to approve the Tax Releases and Refunds

Attachments: April 2015

April 2015 April, 2015

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the Tax Releases and Refunds, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales,
Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

Vote on a request to approve NNP Briar Chapel, LLC for subdivision preliminary and final plat approval of Briar Chapel Development - SD North, consisting of 4 non-residential lots on 19.02 acres located off US Hwy 15-501 and Briar Chapel Pkwy, Baldwin Township, parcel #85632.

Attachments: More Info

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that this Agenda Item be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

15-1246 Resolution Amending the Personnel Policy.

<u>Attachments:</u> Resolution Amending Personnel Policy 5-18-15

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that Resolution #2015-22 Amending the Personnel Policy, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

Vote on a request to approve the County Management Retention and Disposition Schedule.

Attachments: county mgmt signature 2013

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Howard, that the County Management Retention and Disposiiton Schedule, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be approved. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

End of Consent Agenda

PUBLIC INPUT SESSION

Anthony Gaeta submitted the following comments:

I am speaking on behalf of our neighborhood which is located in the triangle formed on the West by Silk Hope Gum Springs Road a number of miles to the Emmaus Baptist Church & School and North Carolina 87 on the East up to Chapel Ridge. We are the rural community adversely affected in the past by the operations of the Military styled gun range called Range 2-A.

The range has ceased operations as a commercial enterprise, due, we understand to its inability to meet the County's noise ordinance restrictions as well as its multiple violations of the County's soil erosion and sedimentation regulations. However, shooting continues on the 70 acres owned by the range and numerous times members of our neighborhood have called upon the Sheriff's Department to enforce the County's noise ordinance. We understand that the Sheriff is proposing amendments to the noise ordinance which would make enforcement of the ordinance difficult to administer.

We oppose any amendment that would create a disincentive for the Sheriff to enforce the existing noise ordinance as we firmly believe this would adversely affect the entire County and the peaceful enjoyment of its citizens due to noxious noise from neighbors. We question the motives of the Sheriff in proposing any amendment. Is it because the Sheriff is tired of our complaints to enforce the existing noise ordinance and believes that amending and possibly neutralizing the ordinance would alleviate his need to enforce it? If the County makes the noise ordinance ineffective to enforce you will virtually eliminate any ability of peaceful citizens to have lawful recourse either through the civil justice system or the Sheriff's Department against intruding neighbors and their noise activities. This is a matter of our citizens ability to peacefully enjoy their property rights. It is not a matter of opposing gun rights. Many of us own guns. Many of us shoot periodically on our land. We do not oppose occasional shooting of guns on one's property.

Secondly, we believe it is time for the County to request the County Attorney to draft a gun range ordinance for the entire County. Many counties have such ordinances to protect the rights of its peaceful citizens to enjoy their property. A gun range ordinance with setbacks from existing residences, businesses, schools and churches as well as busy thoroughfares is vital to the protection and safety of its citizens. The ordinance should have minimum acreage requirements based upon the caliber of the weapons being fired. For example a skeet shooting range where only shotguns are being fired should not require the same acreage that Range 2-A would require where high powered, military style guns were being fired. These types of weapons can carry bullets for many miles if shot at a particular angle. The ordinance should apply to businesses and clubs organized for the predominate purpose of gun shooting. It need not apply to neighbors shooting on their own property where no commercial enterprise is involved. It should require qualified supervision during hours of operation and it should have lower decibel limitations than the County's current noise ordinance because the sound of multiple gunshots is an excruciatingly painful sound, nothing like a loud guitar strum from Shekorri Hills or some other outdoor cultural event.

We know this is a sensitive topic. I stress again this is not a matter of being opposed to the 2nd Amendment or opposed to the ownership of guns. It is a matter of peaceful enjoyment of one's property rights. As Chatham County grows it is important that ordinances such as this be carefully crafted for the benefit and the protection of all its residents.

Martha Girolami, 473 Mt. Pisgah Church Road, Apex, submitted the following comments:

I wanted to ask you to join a lawsuit that has been put forth by Cleanwater North Carolina Statewide Environmental Group. They filed a constitutional challenge to the North Carolina Mining and Energy Commission to their right to overturn local governments ordinances by pre-emption. Such ordinances are created by local governments to protect their communities from the impacts of hydraulic fracturing or fracking. You are in good company if you would join us as intervener. We have plaintiffs, myself, Darryll Moss, the Mayor of Creedmoor, and Anna Baucom, the Chairman of the Anson County Board of Commissioners. The lawyers representing us is James P. Longest and Shannon M. Arata. They are a member of Duke Environmental Law and Policy Clinic. Please consider joining that. It is something that is very important to our County. I think it is a natural for you. It takes some guts to do it. I have a copy for you. I am also very proud of this Board of Commissioners for the amount of information that you have listened to about the coal ash dump down in Moncure. You have held fast and have not made any kind of deal with Duke. You have asked for clarity from Charah and Duke. You have gone back and forth and have really tried to get them to work with you. I don't see how you can make a deal. Duke had a full page add in the News and Observer today for their issue with the Dan River. What they are saying is "we are so sorry for all of that pollution". We don't want them doing that in ten or fifteen years in Moncure. They are the kind of company that just goes ahead and does it and apologizes later when they get caught.

Cindy Perry, 259 Hillsboro Street, Pittsboro, submitted the following comments:

I am a member of the Board of Directors of The Goathouse Refuge, and I too wish to speak on the Noise Ordinance which will be coming to you next month for revisions.

I recently wrote to Sheriff Webster stating that enforcement of this Ordinance is far too complicated. Decibel measurements from the corners of the primary residence, exceptions for occasional music, etc. all this makes it difficult for his office to enforce. And, it means that the complaining party will many times be left unsatisfied as well. I know that several of the people in the vicinity of the Refuge have called, as has the Refuge, and their complaints have gone unresolved.

I remember this Commission dealing with the noise which came from a night club in the southern part of the County. However, this is not a night club, with occasional loud music.

This is a shooting range. Article II, section b(14) of your Noise Ordinance considers the shooting of guns as a noise which is per se an obnoxious nuisance.

One of the neighbors told me this story: Wendy Defour, lives .7 of a mile from the shooting range. One weekend, she had a project for her work which required her to record some material. The shooting range was active that day. She came into the house, closed all the windows and doors, and could not make her recording because the noise was so great that it interfered with her recording.

That is how powerful the noise of these guns can be. And, if it is that powerful inside the Defour's home .7 of a mile away, just imagine how it is at The Goathouse Refuge, right next door to the shooting range.

There has been much discussion about how and where to measure the noise. And, I am here to advocate that noise at a house will disturb the peace and quiet of a family, and is equally an issue to a business. The Goathouse is a non-profit refuge, and the fence to the refuge directly abuts the shooting range. Yes, we realize that both properties are unzoned, and that has given both owners a certain freedom, but it does NOT give the freedom to make a nuisance or noise which materially alters the lifestyle of his/her neighbors' personal residences or businesses.

Any revision to the Ordinance needs to take into account the USE of the property. If it is residential, why measure at the corner of the house, when the Defours and any other neighbor ought to be able to picnic in their yard, utilize a cabin on the far side of their acreage, etc. If it is a business which is a neighbor, like the Goathouse is a business, which saves many animal lives each year, then the noise should be measured at the place where the business operates, not at the corner of Siglinda's house which lies yards away.

I ask you to carefully consider the revisions being offered to this Ordinance. It needs to be improved, but it does not need to be more complex, either in its terms or in its enforcement. It needs to take into consideration the excellent work which The Goathouse does and needs to protect this important resource to this County and others throughout the State, and beyond.

It is not how you feel about cats, about guns, nor the Second Amendment. It's how you feel about peace, and the ability to live and work in this County in peace.

Sharon Garbutt submitted the following comments:

I would like to thank the Board of Commissioners. I have been following closely the coal ash situation here in Chatham County and Lee County. I came tonight to thank you for the strong support you have given to the citizens of Chatham County who have overwhelmingly expressed to you their concerns about having coal ash dumped here. We really appreciate, we heard what happened in Lee County and we appreciate that you have stood strong and refused to sell out our county to Duke Energy. Thank you very much.

John Wagner, 210 Jesamine Lane, Pittsboro, submitted the following comments:

I want to thank each of you for taking care of the health and the surface water and the ground water of our county by not buckling to the coal ash proposals that Duke has. Duke has lost all credibility in this state with the amount of water contamination that has just happened, the fact that they plead guilty to nine different charges related to the water contamination. I sent each of you an electronic copy of what I submitted to DENR and I have one hard copy which I would like to leave you. Thank you.

Ted Dunn, 863 Hatfield, Fearrington, submitted the following comments;

Good Evening. I am a new guy in the county. I have only been here eight years. I am looking around at what is happening and I am concerned for the county. I am not

tied to the county emotionally since I am only here a short time and I am seventy-two years old. I think the county is at a crossroads and an example is Chatham Park. It is a major development and it is going to affect roads, schools, the big expenses, water and it seems that the Commissioners of Pittsboro are the only ones in control of that. It is really concerning to myself and a lot of people in Chatham. I hope you do whatever you can to put some constraints on the development. I am not against development, it happens, but it has to be done with some controls because companies are in business to make money. You people are here to protect the residents of the county. I came here from a county in New Jersey, Bergen County. It was a bedroom community to Manhattan. In the 1950's it was in the same state Chatham County is in now. There used to be a lot of horse farms there and now they are all gone. They have fifty municipalities in Bergen County. Therefore, you have fifty police chiefs, one hundred fifty deputy chiefs, fire chiefs and taxes are astronomical because of all the duplicity of services. I would hate to see that happen in Chatham County. The reason we came down here is because we fell in love with the atmosphere and I hope you can protect it from being changed too much. Thank уои.

PUBLIC HEARINGS

Public Hearing to receive public comments on the Fiscal Year 2015-2016 Recommended Budget

<u>Attachments:</u> RecommendedBudgetPresentation--BOCInitialPresentation

Charlie Horne, County Manager, stated the staff is pleased to recommend the 2015 2016 Budget. He reviewed the Budget at a glance:

The Total Property Valuation is \$9.56 Billion

One penny generates \$939,477

The Tax Rate is 62.19 cents (no change)

The Total Property Tax Revenue is \$59,157,000

The General Fund Fund Balance Appropriated is \$5,528,5363

Renee Paschal, Assistant County Manager, gave a PowerPoint Presentation which reviewed the Budget Process, the goals of the Board of Commissioners, and the highlights of the Budget.

The Chairman opened the public hearing.

Brian Litchfield of Chapel Hill Transit, submitted the following comments:

He believes the Chairman received a letter from Mayor Kleinschmidt of Chapel Hill and Mayor Lavelle of Carrboro related to the funding of the Pittsboro Express Route which is a service we started in partnership with the Town of Pittsboro and the County in 2009. It was funded and worked very well as a regional partnership through 2011 utilizing some grant funding. From 2011 to the current fiscal year it has been funded through the Town of Pittsboro and the Chapel Hill Transit funding partners which are the Town of Chapel Hill, the Town of Carrboro and the University of North Carolina at Chapel Hill. Fifty percent of that funding is not available past this fiscal year. They are asking the Town of Pittsboro and the County if there is an interest in increasing the funding of this service. They have provided what the numbers look like for continuing the service and Mayor Terry is present from the Town of Pittsboro and it is his understanding the Town wants to work with Chapel Hill Transit to

continue the funding. Mr. Litchfield stated he would be happy to answer any questions.

Chairman Crawford asked if Mr. Litchfield found there was a lot of political opposition to the bus system in his part of North Carolina. Mr. Litchfield stated Chapel Hill-Carrboro has the second largest transportation system in North Carolina. They operate about two and half million miles a year carrying around seven million people. It is supported by the towns and heavily invested in by the towns. The Town of Carrboro invests more in the transit than they do in any other entity in the town. Chairman Crawford stated public transit is a bit of a political football in this county. Mr. Litchfield stated he understands having worked with previous commissioners and the County Manager in the past and they are willing to work with the Board however they can move forward.

Commissioner Hales asked if this route runs only between Pittsboro and Chapel Hill. Mr. Litchfield stated that is correct. There are three trips in the morning and three trips at night beginning at the Lowe's in Pittsboro, going down 15-501 and to the university campus, and then making the return trip. They also contract with the Chatham Transit Network to provide two of the trips.

Commissioner Hales asked what he is looking for. Mr. Litchfield stated the estimated annual cost is \$144,000. The Town of Pittsboro has committed to about \$12,000 each year and they are interested in doubling that to about \$24,000. That would leave about \$120,000 for the County or others to cover. The University has expressed interest in covering some of the cost of their employees passes. In the past that money has been reduced from the Town and the County's portion of the cost. If the County is interested he believes that this can be worked out by the three parties.

Commissioner Howard stated she thinks there is interest and the demand is going to continue to grow.

Chairman Crawford asked if the \$144,000 is half the cost of running the line because he had mentioned that half of the cost that they had been getting from the state was going to be gone. Therefore the total cost of running the line must be higher. Mr. Litchfield stated the grant funding will no longer be available at the end of the fiscal year. The costs that he is quoting are the labor costs and the cost of consumables. It does not include overhead or capital costs. This recommendation covers our basic costs of the service. This assumes that the Town of Chapel Hill, the Town of Carrboro and the University put no money into it at this time. If the University helps subsidize the pass it will help reduce that cost.

Crawford stated consumables being the fuel and cleaning the buses, labor being the drivers and maintenance, the buses themselves are essentially what the transit is providing to keep the route going.

Mr. Litchfield stated that was correct. Any staff time associated with any marketing or promotion and any day to day work that keeps the service going was also not included in the cost.

Chairman Crawford stated he wanted to make it clear that the total cost was not being pushed on Chatham County, that it is being split.

Mr. Litchfield stated there still is cost sharing.

Commissioner Petty asked what the ridership is currently compared to 2011 from

Lowe's to the UNC Campus just for the citizens for Chatham County.

Mr. Litchfield stated the route as a whole has gone up quite a bit, about 3,168 riders a month. That does include some trips on campus but the majority of those riders are people getting on at Lowe's and getting off at campus. Back in 2011 they had about 1.600 riders a month.

The County Manager stated this is on the budget work session as an item and they could have Mr. Litchfield come back with more details.

Commissioner Petty asked of the 3,168 riders, how many of those are making a round trip. More specifically, does that mean there were really only 1,500 riders making two trips. Mr. Litchfield stated it would be 1,500 riders. Commissioner Petty stated he believes saying 3,100 riders is a misrepresentation. He believes there should be a better way to clarify the number of people served. Mr. Litchfield stated they refer to it as the number of trips. He stated he can get the exact number of people boarding at the Park and Ride.

Bill Terry, Mayor of Pittsboro, submitted the following comments:

I would like to share with you some historical facts on the service and the general opinion of the Board of Commissioners regarding the value of the service. The Pittsboro Board of Commissioners has asked me to communicate to you that we believe the Pittsboro Express Route is a service worth saving. We recognize, like most forms of public transportation, this bus service serves a small segment of the population, it is expensive to operate and must be supported by government subsidies and grants. That being said, we also recognize that the availability of public transportation is one of the factors considered by individuals looking for a place to work and live and by businesses looking for suitable places to move their business operations. Therefore, we would like to keep this route in service if at all possible. While I have not seen recent updates on the demographics of the Pittsboro Express ridership, my recollection is that in the early years the majority of riders came from western Chatham County, that is to say Siler City and the 64 corridor west of Pittsboro. The second largest group was from the 15-501 corridor south of Pittsboro and Pittsboro residents riding the bus were a small percentage of the total ridership. Mr. Litchfield can give you updated data regarding the demographics at your budget work session. I would also note, to be perfectly candid and fair, it would be inaccurate for me to state that Pittsboro was incredibly enthusiastic when it first began this program. In fact, the Board of Commissioners agreed to fund their share of the program only if it could be funded without a tax increase and without invading fund balance. Eventually it was agreed that we would support the program only as long as the revenues from the newly authorized liquor by the drink referendum were sufficient to offset the cost. Fortunately, those revenues, while they were not as good as expected, were sufficient in the first year. In subsequent years, overall ABC revenues have continued to grow and we have continued to support the Pittsboro Express bus. In the first year, the town budgeted \$24,000 to support the program that was subsequently reduced to \$18,000 based on actual first year costs. They were reduced again to \$12,000 in the year Chatham County removed funding from the program. Our current manager's recommended budget includes \$12,000 in the contract services line for the Pittsboro Express. There is a very high probability that we will keep that funding in our budget. I am willing to ask the Board to go back to the original funding level of \$24,000 but I cannot guarantee I have the three necessary votes to get to that level of funding. To summarize, we need to keep this bus route in service. Finally, I would note if the Town funds it at the \$12,000 level, that represents about three tenths of a percent of the Town's total budget and the

County would be asked to pick up \$129,000 which is about thirteen one hundredth of one percent of its budget. If the Town goes all the way to the \$24,000 level it is .6 percent of their budget and the County's share would be \$117,000 which would be one tenth of one percent of its budget.

Commissioner Howard asked if the Town planned to discuss this at their next Board meeting.

Mayor Terry stated they did plan to discuss it at the next Board meeting. They have been funding it all along and he saw no reason they would discontinue funding it at this time. He is willing to bring to the Board the possibility of increasing the funding to \$18,000 or the original \$24,000 but he cannot guarantee he has the votes to secure that funding.

Commissioner Howard asked if the Town meets before the County has its Budget Work Sessions. Mayor Terry stated their Budget Public Hearing is a week from today and their work sessions will be in June. Commissioner Howard was concerned the County would not have the information about whether or not the Town would commit to an increase while the County was still holding its work sessions. Mayor Terry stated he could ask the Town to commit a week from today but he can't guarantee what their response will be.

Vice Chair Cross stated it would also be helpful to know if the University is going to contribute.

Mr. Litchfield stated the University has expressed an interest in subsidizing the passes, which cost \$65 per month. That amount depends on the number of riders. The amount would be reduced from the amount spent by the County and the Town.

Janet Nichols, 148 Fairview Road, Moncure, submitted the following comments:

Before I begin, I want to thank the board of commissioners and the staff for its hard work on the fiscal year 2015-2016 budget and efforts to make Chatham County one of the best places to live in North Carolina.

In front of you are binders that the folks with Sustainable Prosperity put together to provide information on affordable housing, living wage standards, economic data on Chatham County and for your reference the platforms for the Democratic and Republican parties respectively. My hope is that you will be able to utilize this information as a guide and a source of data and wisdom when you make your decisions regarding this year's budget and future budgets in Chatham County.

This evening I am here to advocate for three basic areas:

- Education.
- Economic Development and
- the Environment.

I am formally requesting that you fund our schools and our teachers to the level that will make us competitive nationally. Our Future economic prospects will depend upon the quality of K-14 education.

Of course economic development will depend upon the quality of our schools, but there are other factors that support it. We must invest annually in transit, affordable housing and arts and culture. I recommend that we fund the bus system, re-instate affordable housing as a line item in the budget and fund it and get serious about funding the arts council and its programming initiatives.

All of these actions will be synergistic in attracting good jobs and businesses, raising the standard of living for Chatham citizens and further enhancing our quality of life in Chatham County.

Finally, I support efforts that will stop fracking in Chatham County and ensure that Duke Progress will be a responsible corporate citizen regarding coal ash in Chatham County. Thank you for your time.

Casey Mann, Toomer Loop, Pittsboro, submitted the following comments:

Good evening. My name is Casey Mann, Maryland native, former Executive Director of the NCDP and a proud resident of Chatham County. I am a single mother of two children, with a son attending Northwood High School and my daughter attending Horton Middle. We live on Toomer Loop in Pittsboro, NC.

I am here because the communities I have lived in for most of my life have made investments in education, housing, transit, food and quality of life. I would not be speaking to you if not for those community investments. I would not have brought my children here if I believed Chatham County lacked the same compassion and long term vision for its residents.

While my mother was going back to school we lived in public housing. It wasn't wicked or scary, it was a safe haven and shelter that allowed my family to get on a corrected course. Without the safety net of shelter and basic needs, my mother, myself — and by extension my kids would not have been able to get ahead. I would not have been able to work in Raleigh and my family would not have been able to move to Pittsboro. As a mother of two, I have spent time sleeping on the couch because the fair market rent was just too much for us to afford three bedrooms.

Chatham County will need a vigorous program to address the current and future growth that we will experience as the county and this part of the state continue to grow and prosper. We need to have an active and staff supported affordable housing committee, not to create some sort of haven for the unrighteous or unwilling, as many would have you believe. We need a strong affordable housing committee because we want to be a righteous and willing community.

We need to have a strategy to ensure that affordable energy and transit are available to all citizens, because without homes that are energy efficient and smartly planned, we fail to have affordable living options for all of our citizens. Our neighbors. There may be jobs and health care, but without transit options, those are not reachable to many. And without energy efficient places to live, the securities of a warm home in the winter or a cool place to sleep in the summer may also be unattainable.

We need to invest directly every year in affordable/workforce housing. I strongly request that you fully fund transit in Chatham County and create a budget line to fund annually affordable housing either directly, via grants, public/private partnerships and/or rental assistance programs in Chatham County. One penny of tax revenue a year would make a good start. Thank you for your time.

Randy Voller, 21 Randolph Court, Pittsboro, submitted the following comments:

I want to provide some bullet points, some facts, that you are going to find within the binders that came from various groups in Raleigh that I think you might find interesting.

- Almost 30,000 people live within 10 miles of downtown Pittsboro.
- That group spends over 226 million dollars a year on shelter.
- Over 10,000 people in our county live in poverty which is approximately 15.6%
- The child poverty rate is 21.9%
- We have 950 less people employed today than we did in 2007.
- In 2007 the Wooten Report done for the Affordable Housing Task Force indicated that we had a latent need for affordable housing of over 800 units and the figure would likely grow every year.
- The median household income for Chatham County in 2013 was \$56,981
- 80% of this median income is \$45,584.
- A very reasonable/conservative loan would be approximately \$115,000 tor homes with 80% of median income and \$145,000 for the actual families with median income.
- In 2014 the TMLS reports that there were 328 residential sales with a median sales price of \$283,200 around Pittsboro.
- In 2015 there have been 98 home sales closed at a median price of \$281,950.
- For the county in 2015, which includes the Pittsboro numbers indicated the YTD homes sales have reached 311 at a median price of \$324,990 and last year they were 989 homes that sold for a median sales price of \$316,000.
- 52% of renters in Chatham County were unable to afford the fair market rent for a 2 bedroom housing unit
- And the minimum wage would need to be increased by 223.6% just to afford the fair housing rent tor a 2 bedroom unit.
- In 2013 6,699 residents in Chatham County needed food stamps. That figure was roughly 9.6% of the population.
- In December of 2014 8,534 people were eligible for Medicaid and another I,846 in Chatham County would benefit if Medicaid were expanded thus bringing the county over 50 million dollars in economic benefits.
- The fair market rent in NC for a two bedroom apartment is \$747.
- A household must earn at least \$29,897 annually or \$14.37 per hour for a forty hour work week 52 weeks a year.
- In Chatham County the fair market rent is \$843 which translates into an annual household income of \$33,720 or \$16.21 per hour. And at minimum wage this would require 2.2 full time jobs for a household.
- HUD now lists the area median income at \$65,700. The median income group can afford a rent of \$1,643 per month which is significantly higher than the large group of people earning less than \$40,000 per year.
- The number of households renting in Chatham County is approximately 5,047.

I just wanted to point out some things we studied on the housing task force for ten years. With growth coming we need to be prepared. This gap is only going to grow. We need to be funding this now and looking for mechanisms to fund it annually. Transit plays in to affordable housing and we need to fund this backbone service. Thank you for your time.

Virginia Penley, 465 Rosswood Road, submitted the following comments:

I have lived in Chatham County for forty years. I would like to speak to the funding of the Chatham County Library. Historically in hard times people who are experiencing those hard times have looked to strong support from the public library to have the opportunity to educate themselves and become job providers. I would like to see an increase to seven days a week that the library is open. Being closed on a

weekend day is a hardship for our school children. The fact is they have e-books available in our library but the funding is so low that you can go in and they will say we had the e-book but you can't check it out to your phone because we have to increase the funding to increase the number of people who can download it. This is insane. It doesn't increase the cost of the staff. A little bit more funding would increase the circulation at the library at no expense to the staff. The third thing is the bookmobile. It is not just for children. There are a lot of people in this county who are shut-ins. My mother-in-law moved here and lived for fifteen years in Fearrington. When she moved here she was able to drive and come to the library. Once she was shut-in she depended on the bookmobile to bring the books she ordered to Fearrington. She could get me or a neighbor to fetch it for her but she was not able to drive to the library anymore. It is not the only place the library was served by the bookmobile and I think it is extremely important that you consider these minor changes to the budget for the library. It would increase equality of our citizens.

15-1247

Public Hearing to receive comments regarding the proposed refinancing and the execution and delivery of the Contract and the Deed of Trust related to the 2006 projects to be refinanced.

Vicki McConnell reviewed the specifics of the item.

The Chairman opened the public hearing.

There was no one present who wished to speak.

The Chairman closed the hearing.

BOARD PRIORITIES

15-1254

Vote on a request to adopt a Resolution Approving a Contract and Deed of Trust and the Delivery Thereof and Providing for Certain Other Related Matters.

<u>Attachments:</u> <u>Extract form Minutes - Approving Resolution - Chatham 2015 LOBs</u>

May 18 2015

A motion was made by Vice Chair Cross, seconded by Commissioner Hales, that Resolution #2015-23 Approving a Contract and a Deed of Trust and the Delivery Thereof and Providing for Certain Other Related Matters, attached hereto and by reference made a part hereof, be adopted. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty

MANAGER'S REPORTS

The County Manager reminded the Board of the Budget Public Hearing in Siler City tomorrow, Tuesday, May 19, 2015 at 6:00 PM in the Town Hall Courtroom.

COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS

Commissioner Hales stated she would like the Draft RFQ for the Comprehensive Land Use Plan to be posted on the County Website because it is coming up for consideration in June.

Chairman Crawford stated the Council on Aging is setting aside \$10,000 in its Community Block Grant this year for volunteers to do home repairs, especially for people in the rural areas. He was invited to participate in a ceremony where an old confederate grave had been discovered in Oakland Township. They were able to clean it up and put back an iron marker that the Daughters of the Confederacy had. It was actually one of two iron markers the Sheriff's Office recovered. It was nice to see something historically being set right.

He stated there is another opening on the CCCC Board of Trustees. Two people have put their names in, Larry Hicks and George Lucier.

Commissioner Howard made a motion to appoint George Lucier.

Vice Chair Cross made a motion to appoint Larry Hicks.

A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Commissioner Hales, that George Lucier be appointed to the CCCC Board of Trustees. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 3 - Chairman Crawford, Vice Chair Hales and Commissioner Howard

No: 2 - Commissioner Cross and Commissioner Petty

COMMISSIONERS' REPORTS

Commissioner Howard stated at last week's EDC meeting there were two interesting conversations. One was with regard to Comprehensive Plan. BJ Copeland gave an excellent presentation with the support of Jason Sullivan on the plan, on the various committees and what they were doing and how the plan would move forward. They also presented how the plan supports some of the other plans that have been created by other departments and boards around the county, many of which have not been adopted but could be reviewed and revisited within the context of a Comprehensive Plan. It was very well received, there were great questions. The EDC is prepared to support the Comprehensive Plan and to meet with BJ Copeland and hear more about the way that the process is moving forward, which was very encouraging. The second thing they discussed was the ways K-14 across Chatham County can better position our students to step into manufacturing roles and be prepared for going into the workforce. One of the things that came up was whether we as K-12 are preparing the kids well enough to go into the workforce or to go into the community college and become productive relatively quickly. It was exciting to her the following night to go to the CTE awards presentation and see the number of children that were being awarded their CNA's, Microsoft ITA, Excel and Access. There were so many young students rising to the level of joining the technical honor society from across the county. It was a testament that we are still doing really good work at that level and encouraging our students to take some of those work relevant skills in school and be better prepared either for a two year associates degree or to go into a four year degree and move on. It was very heartening to see the number of kids across all demographics, all income brackets and their families there in support.

Commissioner Hales stated she heard from Randall Riggsbee from the Chatham News that Margaret Jordan Ellis has passed away. She knows there are a number of people in the County and staff who have worked with her. She was ninety-two. She is the power behind the camelback bridge being located on the Deep River at Gulf. Commissioner Hales was sad to hear of this news. Ms. Ellis was a marvelous woman who talked the talk and walked the walk when it came to trying to do the best she could for the Deep River and providing a little park available for everybody's use on both sides of the river.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Howard, seconded by Commissioner Hales, that this meeting be adjourned. The motion carried by the following vote:

Aye: 5 - Chairman Crawford, Commissioner Cross, Vice Chair Hales, Commissioner Howard and Commissioner Petty